

I-195 REDEVELOPMENT DISTRICT COMMISSION

MEETING OF COMMISSION **PUBLIC SESSION** **DECEMBER 18, 2024**

The I-195 Redevelopment District (the “District”) Commission (the “Commission”) met on Wednesday, December 18, 2024, in Public Session, beginning at 5:00 P.M., at District Hall, located at 225 Dyer Street, Second Floor, Providence, Rhode Island pursuant to a notice of the meeting to all Commissioners and public notice of the meeting as required by applicable Rhode Island law.

The following Commissioners were present and participated throughout the meeting: Chairperson Marc Crisafulli, Dr. Barrett Bready, Mr. Robert McCann, Ms. Sandra Smith, Mr. Vincent Masino, and ex-officio board member Mr. Joseph Mulligan.

Also, present were Ms. Caroline Skuncik, District Executive Director, Ms. Amber Ilcisko, District Director of Operations, Ms. Sarina Conn, District Office Manager, and Mr. Charles F. Rogers of Locke Lord, LLP, legal counsel to the District.

Not present were Commissioner Ms. Mindy Penney and ex-officio board member Ms. Elizabeth Tanner.

Ms. Tanner joined the meeting at 5:15 P.M.

Chairperson Crisafulli called the meeting to order at 5:03 P.M.

1. PUBLIC COMMENT SESSION.

No members of the public signed up to speak during public comment session.

2. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETINGS HELD ON NOVEMBER 6, 2024.

Chairperson Crisafulli stated that the minutes of the November 6, 2024, meetings had been distributed to the Commissioners and asked if there were any comments or corrections.

There being none, upon motion made by Mr. McCann and seconded by Mr. Masino, the following vote was adopted:

VOTED: To approve the minutes of the Commission meetings held on November 6, 2024.

Voting in favor of the foregoing were: Chairperson Crisafulli, Dr. Bready, Ms. Smith, Mr. McCann, and Mr. Masino.

Voting against the foregoing were: None.

3. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT ON DISTRICT ACTIVITIES.

Ms. Skuncik provided an update on projects in the District, including progress on the construction of 150 Richmond and the recent announcement of the finalized agreement between Ancora and the Rhode Island Life Sciences Hub (RILSH) to fund a 29,000-SF lab incubator to be located in 150 Richmond in which the Commission is contributing \$1 million in addition to the RILSH's contribution of \$9 million. She stated the agreement related to the Commission's funding is being finalized. Ms. Skuncik continued with the announcement that the first phase of Parcel 9 received its Certificate of Occupancy and stated a closing of the sale of the second phase of Parcel 9 would take place in the coming days. She then provided an update on proposed projects, this included the proposed project for Parcel 2 which is currently getting updated construction pricing with a goal to break ground in 2025, the proposed development on Parcel 1a that is currently going through the review process with the State Historic Preservation Officer, and that the proposed development on Parcels 14 and 15 would likely be coming back to the Commission for design review in January. Ms. Skuncik concluded her report with an update on the construction of the park pavilion and the upcoming City's New Year's Eve celebration taking place in District Park.

There was no further discussion.

4. PRESENTATION BY RES GROUP REGARDING PROPOSED DEVELOPMENTS ON PARCEL 5.

Chairperson Crisafulli stated that EQT Exeter had withdrawn their proposal for consideration to develop Parcel 5. He then introduced Bruce Murray of RES Group, the District's real estate and economic analysis consultant. Mr. Murray used a Power Point presentation to present a comparison of the three remaining proposals from Bluedog Capital Partners, Design Center Partners, and Transom Real Estate. He then presented a snapshot and the strengths and weaknesses of each proposal, the apartment demand in Providence, the residential condominium demand in Providence, and the short-term rental market in Providence.

Discussion continued on the potential unit rate for a rental or condo unit on Parcel 5.

5. PRESENTATION BY UTILE, INC. REGARDING PROPOSED DEVELOPMENTS ON PARCEL 5.

Chairperson Crisafulli introduced Tim Love of Utile, Inc. Mr. Love used a Power Point presentation to present a summary of the design review panel's review of the three final proposed developments on Parcel 5. His presentation included a summary comparing the proposals from Bluedog Capital Partners, Design Center Partners, and Transom Real Estate followed by a review of the building massing and materiality, public realm activation, parking design, and vulnerability to value engineering of each proposed development.

There was no further discussion.

6. PUBLIC COMMENT REGARDING THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENTS ON PARCEL 5.

Chairperson Crisafulli stated that there would be no decision at this meeting and that the three final developers would be invited back to present at a future meeting. He acknowledged the receipt of a letter from building trades in support of the proposal by Bluedog Capital Partners. Seven members of the public provided comment on the proposed developments on Parcel 5. Comments were in favor of The Design Center's program and the need for a space to design and activate. Others were in favor of Bluedog Capital Partners and high-end condominium units. There were also questions regarding the analyses presented by RES Group and Utile.

There was no further discussion.

7. PRESENTATION REGARDING THE APPLICATION BY PENNROSE LLC FOR A WAIVER FROM THE PROVISIONS OF SECTION 2.5.2.d OF THE DISTRICT DEVELOPMENT PLAN WITH RESPECT TO THE PROPOSED FAÇADE TRANSPARENCY PERCENTAGE FOR THE PROPOSED MIXED-USE DEVELOPMENT ON A PORTION OF PARCEL 9.

Ms. Rebecca Schofield of Pennrose presented the request for a transparency waiver for a minimum of 25% transparency for upper story uses. She used a Power Point presentation to present the transparency waiver request for the second phase of the proposed development on Parcel 9 which included an aerial view looking south, a rendering of a view looking south, a rendering of a view from the parking lot, and updated elevations.

There was no further discussion.

8. PRESENTATION BY UTILE, INC. REGARDING THE APPLICATION SUBMITTED BY PENNROSE LLC FOR A WAIVER WITH RESPECT TO THE PROPOSED MIXED-USE DEVELOPMENT ON A PORTION OF PARCEL 9.

Ms. Zoe Mueller of Utile, Inc. provided a summary of Utile's recommendation to approve the waiver requested by Pennrose LLC allowing for a minimum of 25% transparency for upper story uses as outlined in the memorandum provided to the Commission.

There was no further discussion.

9. PUBLIC HEARING REGARDING THE APPLICATION SUBMITTED BY PENNROSE LLC FOR A WAIVER WITH RESPECT TO THE PROPOSED MIXED-USE DEVELOPMENT ON A PORTION OF PARCEL 9.

No members of the public signed up to provide comment regarding the request for a waiver for the proposed development on a portion of Parcel 9.

10. VOTE REGARDING THE APPLICATION SUBMITTED BY PENNROSE LLC FOR A WAIVER WITH RESPECT TO THE PROPOSED MIXED-USE DEVELOPMENT ON A PORTION OF PARCEL 9.

There being no further discussion, upon motion made by Mr. McCann and seconded by Ms. Smith,

the following vote was adopted:

VOTED: That the resolution regarding approval of upper floor façade transparency waiver for Parcel 9 Phase 2 (a copy of which is attached hereto as Exhibit A), be, and it hereby, is adopted and approved.

Voting in favor of the foregoing were: Chairperson Crisafulli, Ms. Smith, Mr. McCann, Dr. Bready, and Mr. Masino.

Voting against the foregoing were: None.

11. DISCUSSION AND VOTE TO REALLOCATE EARNED INTEREST AND SAVINGS FROM PREVIOUS ALLOCATIONS OF THE 195 PROJECT FUND TO BE REPLENISHED BACK INTO THE FUND.

Ms. Skuncik summarized the request outlined in the proposed resolution. She stated the vote does three things, which includes reallocating savings from previous allocations of the 195 Project Fund that came in under budget and puts those funds back into the Project Fund for future allocations, puts interest earned on unexpended funds into the Project Fund to be used for future allocations, and reallocates \$125,000 from a previous allocation of \$500,000 for infrastructure improvements initially earmarked for pedestrian safety improvements near South Street Landing that is no longer moving forward, toward the construction of the park pavilion.

There being no further discussion, upon motion made by Ms. Smith and seconded by Mr. Masino, the following vote was adopted:

VOTED: That the resolution regarding Project Fund matters (a copy of which is attached hereto as Exhibit B), be, and it hereby, is adopted and approved.

Voting in favor of the foregoing were: Chairperson Crisafulli, Ms. Smith, Mr. McCann, Dr. Bready, and Mr. Masino.

Voting against the foregoing were: None.

12. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE 2025 COMMISSION MEETING CALENDAR.

Chairperson Crisafulli stated a proposed Commission meeting calendar had been circulated for 2025. He asked the Commissioners to let staff know within the week if there were any conflicts with the proposed dates.

There was no further discussion.

13. EXECUTIVE SESSION

Chairperson Crisafulli stated that pursuant to the notice of the meeting, the Commission would go into Executive Session for discussion regarding the purchase and sale of District real estate.

Accordingly, upon motion duly made by Dr. Bready and seconded by Mr. McCann, the following vote was adopted:

VOTED: To go into Closed Session, pursuant to the Open Meetings Act, Rhode Island General Laws Section 42-46-5 (the Open Meetings Law) and 42-64.14.6(i) (the I-195 Act), to discuss matters relating to the purchase, sale, exchange, lease, or value of real property of District real estate where the discussion in an open meeting would have a detrimental effect on the negotiating position of the Commission with the other party to the negotiations.

Voting in favor of the foregoing were: Chairperson Crisafulli, Ms. Smith, Mr. McCann, Dr. Bready, and Mr. Masino.

Voting against the foregoing were: None.

Commissioners and District staff entered into Closed Session at 6:15 P.M.

Chairperson Crisafulli left the closed session at 6:44 P.M.

The Public Session was reconvened at 6:47 P.M.

Dr. Bready reported that the discussion in the Executive Session was confined to review and discussion of proposals regarding the purchase and sale of District real estate and that no votes were taken. Additionally, the Commission voted to end the Executive Session, maintain the Executive Session minutes, and reconvene the Public Session

Upon motion duly made by Ms. Smith, and seconded by Mr. Masino, the following vote was adopted:

VOTED: That pursuant to Rhode Island General Laws Section 42-46-5(a), the Open Meetings Act, the minutes of the Closed Session shall not be made available to the public, except as to the portions of such minutes as the Commission ratifies and reports in Public Session of the meeting until disclosure would no longer jeopardize the Commission's negotiating positions.

Voting in favor of the foregoing were: Ms. Smith, Mr. McCann, Dr. Bready, and Mr. Masino.

Voting against the foregoing were: None

14. VOTE TO ADJOURN.


There being no further discussion, upon motion made by Mr. Masino and seconded by Ms. Smith, the following vote was adopted:

VOTED: That the meeting be adjourned.

Voting in favor of the foregoing were: Mr. McCann, Ms. Smith, Dr. Bready, and Mr. Masino.

Voting against the foregoing were: None.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:49 P.M.



Marc Crisafulli, Chairperson
Barrett Bready, Acting

EXHIBIT A

I-195 REDEVELOPMENT DISTRICT

**RESOLUTION REGARDING APPROVAL OF UPPER FLOOR FAÇADE TRANSPARENCY
WAIVER FOR PARCEL 9 / PHASE 2**

December 18, 2024

- WHEREAS: Pursuant to the Rhode Island Special Economic Development District Enabling Act (the “SEDD Act”), the Commission is charged with approving all plans for development within the I-195 Redevelopment District; and
- WHEREAS: Pursuant to the SEDD Act, the Commission has adopted a Development Plan applicable to construction within the I-195 Redevelopment District; and
- WHEREAS On January 18, 2023, the Commission granted a waiver to Pennrose, LLC (“Pennrose”), the proposed purchaser of Phase 2 of Parcel 9, from the provisions of *Section 2.5 A.2.d.* of the Development Plan with respect to upper floor transparency for a residential use for the proposed development on Parcel 9, Phase 2 (the “Project”); and
- WHEREAS As required by the Commission, Pennrose has made certain revisions to the plans for the Project and as a result of such revisions Pennrose has requested a further waiver from the provisions of *Section 2.5 A. 2. d* of the Development Plan with respect to upper floor façade transparency for a residential use at the Project (the “2024 Waiver”); and
- WHEREAS: Utile, Inc., the District’s design consultant (“Utile”), has determined that the 2024 Waiver is appropriate and has recommended, by letter dated December 4, 2024, a copy of which letter is attached hereto as Exhibit A and is incorporated herein by reference (the “Utile Letter”), that the District grant the 2024 Waiver; and
- WHEREAS: At a public hearing held this date, the Commission heard a presentation by Utile with respect to the 2024 Waiver; and
- WHEREAS: The Commission invited comments from the public, but none were offered.
- NOW, THEREFORE, acting by and through its Commissioners, the District hereby resolves as follows:
- RESOLVED: That the District hereby (a) finds that, given the geography of Parcel 9 Phase 2, budgetary constraints imposed by state funding for affordable housing and Rhode Island Housing energy efficiency targets, enforcement of the upper floor façade transparency regulations for a residential use contained in the Development Plan

would preclude the full enjoyment by the owner of a permitted use and amount to more than a mere inconvenience, (b) adopts the recommendations contained in the Ufile Letter with respect to the 2024 Waiver and (c) grants the 2024 Waiver.

EXHIBIT A

UTILE LETTER

utile

December 4, 2024

Caroline Skuncik
Executive Director
I-195 Redevelopment District
225 Dyer Street, Fourth Floor,
Providence, RI 02903

RE: Parcel 9, Phase 2 Upper Story Transparency Waiver Recommendation

Dear Caroline,

Utile, the I-195 Redevelopment District's Urban Design and Planning consultant, recommends that the Commission grant the requested waiver (see below) for Phase 2 of the Pennrose proposal for Parcel 9.

Summary of Prior Transparency Waivers Granted

Parcel 9 Phase 2 has been granted three transparency waivers to date:

- Section 2.5.A.2.b.i: a reduced minimum of 40% transparency for non-residential ground floor uses (December 2020),
- Section 2.5.A.2.c: a reduced minimum of 30% transparency for residential ground floor uses (December 2020), and
- Section 2.5.A.2.d: a reduced minimum of 30% transparency for upper story uses (January 2023).

Waiver Recommendation

Utile recommends that the requested transparency waiver to Section 2.5.A.2.d of the 2020 Development Plan allowing for a minimum of 25% transparency for upper story uses is granted based on the following site- and project-specific constraints and contextual factors:

1. Residential Context: nearby commercial uses are minimal now and for the foreseeable future (unlike elsewhere in the District), so a more residential level of transparency is contextually appropriate.
2. Unique Siting: four public-facing facades makes it difficult to accommodate resident parking, service and back-of-house uses while meeting the transparency requirement.
3. CityWalk Frontage: does not require commercial activation, intensive planting, murals and other activation is sufficient.
4. State Funding Constraints & Standards: budgetary constraints imposed by state funding combined with market-based cost escalation and Rhode Island Housing (RIH) energy efficiency targets would make it cost-prohibitive to meet the transparency requirements in this context for this program.

Architecture
& Planning

115 Kingston St.
Boston, MA 02111

110 Union St.
Providence, RI 02903

(617) 423-7200
utilledesign.com

utile

Please do not hesitate to reach out if you have questions or would like additional information.

Regards,



Tim Love, Principal
Utile
115 Kingston Street
Boston, MA 02111

Architecture
& Planning

115 Kingston St.
Boston, MA 02111

110 Union St.
Providence, RI 02903

(617) 423-7200
utilledesign.com

EXHIBIT B

I-195 REDEVELOPMENT DISTRICT

RESOLUTION REGARDING PROJECT FUND MATTERS

December 18, 2024

- WHEREAS:** The I-195 Redevelopment District (the "District") was created and exists as a public corporation, governmental agency and public instrumentality of the State of Rhode Island (the "State") under Chapter 64.14 of Title 42 of the General Laws of Rhode Island (the "Act"); and
- WHEREAS:** Chapter 64.24 of Title 42 of the General Laws of Rhode Island (the "Project Fund Act") authorizes the District, acting through its Commission (the "Commission"), to provide financial assistance to projects on the I-195 Land in order to enhance the State's economic vitality; and
- WHEREAS:** The Commission has promulgated rules and regulations (the "Rules") governing the funding program established by the Project Fund Act. Capitalized terms used herein but not defined shall have the meanings as set forth in the Rules; and
- WHEREAS:** The State has appropriated funds (the "Project Funds") to be allocated by the Commission pursuant to the Project Fund Act, which Project Funds are held in an account maintained by the District (the "Project Fund Account"); interest on the Project Funds has accrued and will continue to accrue and the Commission wishes to include all such accrued and future accrued interest within the Project Fund and available to be allocated pursuant to the Project Fund Act and the Rules; and
- WHEREAS:** Pursuant to Resolution dated June 16, 2021 (the "2021 Resolution"), the Commission agreed to provide disbursements from the Project Fund Account not to exceed \$500,000 for certain improvements to the I-195 Land; \$375,000 of such funds have been distributed, the pedestrian improvements contemplated by the 2021 Resolution have been abandoned and a balance of \$125,000 remains which the Commission wishes to apply to supplement the cost of construction of the park pavilion which is an improvement to the I-195 Land; and
- WHEREAS:** The District has from time to time made allocations of Project Funds pursuant to the Project Fund Act and the Rules to assist projects on the I-195 Land but in some cases and for various reasons relating to such projects such funds have either not been advanced to the applicants or not advanced in full and the funds are no longer required for the projects and the District wishes to be able to reallocate such unadvanced Project Funds to other projects qualifying under the Project Fund Act; and

NOW, THEREFORE, acting by and through its Commissioners, the District hereby resolves as follows:

RESOLVED:

- ~~1. That any and all interest that has accrued to date and that will in the future accrue in the Project Fund Account shall be included in the Project Fund Account and made available to provide financial assistance to projects on the I-195 Land pursuant to the Project Fund Act and the Rules.~~
2. That the \$125,000 remaining from 2021 Resolution be and it hereby is allocated to the District to supplement such costs of construction of the park pavilion as the Chairperson and the Executive Director may determine in their discretion.
3. That the allocations of Project Funds to the projects described on Exhibit A attached hereto in the amounts set forth on Exhibit A are hereby terminated and such previously allocated Project Funds shall be made available to such other projects qualifying under the Project Fund Act as the Commission may determine from time to time pursuant to the Rules.
4. That allocations of Project Funds previously made or made after the date hereof and either not advanced or not advanced in full, for whatever reasons, may be terminated by the Executive Director in his/her discretion and made available to such other projects qualifying under the Project Fund Act as the Commission may determine from time to time pursuant to the Rules.

Exhibit A

Project	Commitment	Spent to Date	Unused Funds	Date Approved
National Grid: Wire Burial	\$ 500,000	\$ 483,422	\$ 16,578	5.15.2017
National Grid: Riverwalk	\$ 735,000	\$ 704,821	\$ 30,179	5.15.2017/12.14.2022
Temporary Parking	\$ 1,000,000	\$ 101,851	\$ 898,149	9.26.17
Park Management Consultant Phase 2	\$ 75,000	\$ 74,930	\$ 70	8.28.18
Venture Café	\$ 48,000	\$ 41,900	\$ 6,100	10.4.2018
Parcel 28/Parking	\$ 250,000	\$ 151,924	\$ 98,076	12.19.2018
Acquisition	\$ 400,000	\$ 231,668	\$ 168,333	10.21.2020